

**6/11/2019
Council Chambers – Lower Level
57 East 1st Street
4:30 PM**

A work session of the Design Review Board was held at the City of Mesa Council Chamber – Lower Level, 57 East 1st Street at 4:30 p.m.

Board Members Present:

Chair Nicole Posten-Thompson
Vice Chair J. Seth Placko
Boardmember Sean Banda*
Boardmember Randy Carter
Boardmember Jeanette Knudsen
Boardmember Scott Thomas

Board Members Absent:

(*Boardmember Banda participated in the meeting through the use of telephonic equipment until 5:52pm)

Staff Present:

Nana Appiah
Tom Ellsworth
Lesley Davis
Evan Balmer
Lisa Davis
Cassidy Welch
Heather Omta
Rebecca Gorton

Others Present:

Others Present

Chair Nicole Posten-Thompson welcomed everyone to the Work Session at 4:30 p.m.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
June 11, 2019**

A.1. DRB19-00203 Within the 7500 block of East Broadway Road (south side)

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located west of the southwest corner of Broadway Road and Sossaman Road. (1.7± acres).
REQUEST: Review of a medical facility.
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 5
OWNER: Bella Beats, LLC
APPLICANT: Todd Lawrence, Tech MD Consultants
STAFF PLANNER: Wahid Alam, AICP

Discussion:

- ❖ Lesley Davis, Senior Planner, presented the case for Wahid Alam. She explained that the case proposes a new medical office and surgery center with a future building at the rear of the property. It is currently an empty lot. The parking will be in the rear. The Landscaping is consistent with area. Staff would like board to consider the proportion of Porte Cochere with the main building and the method of mechanical screening.
- ❖ Architects, Ed Marley and Julie Stewart with Swaim Associates, 7350 E Speedway, Tucson, presented materials and design. They explained the building design and materials they chose. They noted that the Porte Cochere served as there required patient drop off area.
- ❖ Comment from Public – Dave Dunwarth, 7520 E Capri: Owns property SW of site. Mr. Dunwarth explained that there are flooding issues on his property due to the grade of this site and concerns about his wall. Chair Posten-Thomson explained that the applicant will have to provide a grading and drainage plan for the site, which would address this problem. The applicant confirmed that his wall would not be altered. He also noted that there is a gopher issues on the site. Staff member Lesley Davis confirmed that the applicant is required to address that issue through a previous zoning stipulation on the property.
- ❖ Chair Nicole Posten-Thompson:
 - Copper materials are a nice feature.
 - Likes canopy.
 - Design is reading heavy and dark. Lighten up the design in some way.
 - Recommends accentuating the window fins.
- ❖ Vice Chair Placko:
 - Landscape: two islands are thin, not enough soil mass for the tree to grow.
 - Move sidewalk to one side or the other.
 - East side of Porte Cochere might want to slide mesquite north because of maintenance issues.

Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes June 11, 2019

❖ Boardmember Carter:

- Thought the material or design could be improved.
- The large Porte Cochere could be lowered down.
- The renderings make the front of the building appear like a metal building rather than masonry building with a metal band.
- Building needs focus in the design.
- Raise parapets up to hide mechanical equipment on roof.
- Colors are too dark.
- Materials are rich.
- Feels it should be more of a lively look; too dark especially for surgery center.
- The current design puts a heavy emphasis on Porte Cochere rather than the main building.
- Architecture needs to revitalize the area; looking for contemporary design.

❖ Boardmember Thomas:

- Very linear and very flat.
- Likes the front entry with columns between windows.

❖ Boardmember Banda:

- Agrees building looks heavy. Feels industrial.
- Suggested a mix of CMU and banding, used the Starbucks near Ikea in Tempe as an example.
- Agrees building is too somber. More variety and fun is needed to enhance architecture.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
June 11, 2019**

A.2. DRB19-00244 **Within the 1400 block of South Crismon Road (west side) and within the 9900 block of East Hampton Avenue (south side)**

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located north of the US60 Superstition Freeway on the west side of Crismon Road. (1.1 ± acres).

REQUEST: Review of new retail building.

COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 5

OWNER: SWC Crismon & Hampton LLC

APPLICANT: Michael Oakleaf, Archicon Architecture and Interiors, L.C.

STAFF PLANNER: Lisa Davis, AICP

Discussion:

- ❖ Lisa Davis, Planner II, presented the case. She identified that the staff concerns related to the entry element and exit door with the small overhang.
- ❖ Applicant, Jeff Koski, 5055 E Washington St., PHX represented the project. He explained that the front tower element was designed to comply with the approved design guidelines for this development. He described the use of the metal panels, stucco, CMU, and metal awnings.
- ❖ Chair Posten-Thompson:
 - Entry looks like an RV canopy.
 - Tower is not deep enough.
 - Likes materials.
 - Cautioned the applicant on how they integrate the canopy into wall.
- ❖ Vice Chair J. Seth Placko:
 - Suggested they review the landscape along the south elevation. Noted this is a major access way in and out of development and needs better screening.
 - Recommends larger than 5 gal plants and trees for initial planting.
 - Doesn't recommend "melon ball" trimmed trees but rather a fuller tree.
 - Texas Mt. Laurels are too small. Need larger Tecoma trees, ~~such as Tecoma~~.
- ❖ Boardmember Thomas:
 - Asked about the dimension of the metal siding gap? Response: 8" horizontal rib siding.
 - Likes parapet, wants to metal on awnings thicker, wants thicker than 8" for siding. Front column looks dainty compared to everything else.
- ❖ Boardmember Carter:
 - Likes building other than entry.
 - Columns are undersized for an entry.
- ❖ Boardmember Banda:
 - Agrees with board, front columns look spindly.
 - The return on canopy needs more depth.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
June 11, 2019**

A.3. DRB19-00253 **Within the 4500 block of East Banner Gateway Drive (south side) and within the 1700 and 1800 blocks of Old Greenfield Road (east side)**

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located north of Baseline Road and east of Greenfield Road. (4± acres).

REQUEST: Review of an assisted living facility with a nursing home.

COUNCIL DISTRICT: District

OWNER: Langley Banner Gateway, LLC

APPLICANT: Ralph Pew, Pew & Lake, PLC

STAFF PLANNER: Cassidy Welch

Discussion:

- ❖ Cassidy Welch, Planner I presented case. She explained the proposed site will be assistant living with memory care with parking on the sides and rear and it is 3 stories. She stated that staff thought it was a contemporary building and fit into the neighborhood.
- ❖ Vanessa Macdonald, with Pew & Lake, 1744 S. Val Vista Dr, Ste 217, represented the project along with the architect Rich, Barber, 2944 N 44th St, Ste. 101, PHX. Ms. MacDonald explained that the site will have added security for the memory care portion of facility. Mr. Barber explained that no parking will be in front of building. He said first time users up front will use front parking. He noted that they chose a lodge feel design with wood detail and softer looking design to appeal to residential nearby.
- ❖ Chair Posten-Thompson:
 - Noted that although it is not part of the DRB consideration, she would recommend they look at using larger signage.
 - She appreciates the building elements incorporated into the design of the sign .
 - Recommends integrating colors and materials in carport.
- ❖ Boardmember Carter:
 - Disagrees with sign recommendation. He thought the access was difficult access so there is not a lot of traffic to warrant a larger sign.
 - Likes architecture; thought design was comforting.
- ❖ Vice Chair Placko:
 - Asked if property to south, is it flood irrigated? He said he does not recommend Sissoo trees if flood irrigated because the trees will take walls out when the trees mature.
 - Suggested Shoestring Willow Acacia or something similar for the south wall.
 - Cautioned the use of spiny, thorny plants because of pedestrian routes. Refrain from ocotillo, agave, prickly pear or similar plants.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
June 11, 2019**

A.4. DRB19-00287 6253 South Sossaman Road.

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located east of Sossaman Road south of Ray Road. (4.5 ± acres).
REQUEST: Review of new airport hangar facility to replace an existing hangar.
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 6
OWNER: Phoenix-Mesa Gateway Airport Authority
APPLICANT: Larson Associates Architects
STAFF PLANNER: Wahid Alam, AICP

Discussion:

- ❖ Lesley Davis, Senior Planner presented the case for Wahid Alam. She explained that the project is located at Phoenix-Mesa-Gateway Airport facing Sossaman Road. She noted that lighting and landscape are sensitive for airport needs and that there are no staff concerns with the building design.
- ❖ Architect, Lance Meinhold, 3807 N 24th St., PHX represented the project. He explained that the design of the building and how it is scaled down at the entries to greet the public. He also explained that the exterior pattern is intentional and is based on Pi(3.14).
- ❖ Chair Nicole Posten-Thompson:
 - Said she is excited about the concept and design
 - Likes the pop of color at the entry.
- ❖ Boardmember Carter:
 - Likes breaking up the elements and different facets
- ❖ Vice Chair J. Seth Placko:
 - Suggested they revise the landscape plan to replace the two trees in parking lot diamonds; He suggested they swap the blue and hybrid Palo Verde with the trees at the entry drive.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
June 11, 2019**

A.5. DRB19-00379 1666 South Dobson Road

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located west of Dobson Road and south of the U.S. 60 Freeway. (10 ± acres).

REQUEST: Review of new multiple residence development to replace the existing hotel.

COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 3

OWNER: TIC Dobson Ranch 1, LLC

APPLICANT: Brennan Ray, Burch & Cracchiolo, P.A.,

REPRESENTATIVE:

STAFF PLANNER: Evan Balmer, AICP

Discussion:

- ❖ Evan Balmer, Planner II presented the case for the existing Dobson Ranch Inn site on the southwest corner of Dobson Road and US60. He discussed the landscaping and building elevations. He noted that the building exterior is stucco, with no additional materials. He said that staff is concerned with the lack of diversity in design and materials and that the garage is a very dominate feature throughout and lacks variation. He also noted that Dobson and US60 is a high-profile intersection. He presented an email he received from a resident that stated that the residents in the area would like all of the parking to be covered, buildings 6 and 7 relocated to the west property line, and speed humps added on Isabella Road. The email was from Joseph Shipley, 2147 W. Isthmus Loop.
- ❖ Applicant Brennan Ray, 702 E Osborne, Phoenix represented the project. He noted that this site is the Dobson Ranch Inn and Fiesta Bar and Grill. He noted challenges with vagrancy and said the site is in disrepair. He also noted the project is not student housing and will be market rate housing with no individual units for sale. He said the building has strong shadow lines, creating depth and a flat roof that hides air conditioning (AC) units. He noted that the feels the project has adequate parking and residents will not need to park on Isabella. It will be a gated Development and the concept is what they have built down at Chandler Fashion Mall. He said they will discuss all amenities at the neighborhood meeting next week.
- ❖ Architect- Rich Barber 2944 N 44th St. Ste 101, PHX, also represented this project. He noted that the grade on the north portion of site is recessed and goes uphill as you move toward the freeway. He said this helps create buffers for noise from the freeway. The apartment units are oriented toward the center of the site to focus on amenities. He said that 30% of units can have garages on the 1st floor of their building, which aligns with market demand and is a higher value for residents. He noted that the garages face internally with car courts. He said he felt the various building heights play together and deep recesses are provided for balconies. He also noted that he felt the dominate material of stucco, was consistent designs of homes within the Dobson Ranch area.

Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes June 11, 2019

- ❖ Public speaker Jeanie Rutkowski, 2235 W Isabella Ave: Identified concerns regarding adequate parking. She said there are currently issues with parking on the street and that she had a speed bump petition conducted. She is concerned about adding to the car count, increasing congestion and complicating access to US60 from Dobson Rd.
- ❖ Public speaker, Beverly Eich, 2163 W Isthmus Loop. Noted that she is worried about subsidized housing.
- ❖ Public speaker Gene Stankowski, 2146 W Isabella Ave.: Identified concern with transportation, traffic flow, the number of units.
- ❖ Public speaker Nate Caine, 2315 W Keats: Stated that Dobson Ranch has a nice lake and park. He asked if the proposed site will have playgrounds and dog walking, or will the incoming residents need to cross the street to use Dobson Ranch park? The applicant noted that those amenities would be provided within the new development.
- ❖ Chair Nicole Posten-Thompson:
 - Simplistic design.
 - Suggests that the applicant discuss how many bedroom units there will be at their neighborhood meeting.
 - Suggests a traffic study.
 - She noted that the traffic study and site concerns are more appropriate for discussion at the Planning and Zoning Board Hearing.
 - Needs a more modern design.
 - Likes the Chandler example with modern windows.
 - Does recommend enhanced carport design.
- ❖ Boardmember Banda:
 - Doesn't have a modern feel nor a retro feel.
 - Stucco dominate with parking canopy facing Dobson is not appropriate.
 - Paint to represent depth is a mistake.
 - Noted that this proposed project is not the same caliber as other projects by this developer and needs to be improved.
 - More opportunity to enhance facades.
 - Wants to make sure paddock area is a stamped material.
 - No elevations for canopies. Are they standard metal canopies?
 - Likes the lighting.

Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes June 11, 2019

❖ Boardmember Carter:

- Inquired about how much parking is being reduced.
- He felt the basic form is pretty good.
- Agrees with Boardmember Banda that they need to break up forms.
- Highly visible site location – need an improved design.
- Noted other materials need to be added to the project.
- the facade of buildings needs to be livened up.

❖ Vice Chair Placko:

- Noted there is lots of grass and shade trees in Dobson Ranch and that the design has lots of Pine trees.
- He has concerns about Ash trees. They need lots of water to survive.
- Can't decipher artificial grass and real grass in rendering. Need clarification.
- To blend with adjacent neighborhood, he felt they need more grass.
- He said there is an interesting mix of plants in legend.
- He noted that ADOT will not approve of trees hanging over wall.
- West property line needs more trees.
- Ficus tree are not low water using trees.

❖ Staff member Evan Balmer provided some clarification for the board. He noted:

- The case is still going through P&Z review.
- The Zoning Ordinance requires 2.1 parking spaces per unit and the applicant is proposing 1.6 spaces per unit. The project has a total of 288 dwelling units.
- Transportation reviews site plan; taking note of traffic concerns.
- Based on the Board's comments the applicant should re-evaluate the design to include:
 - Diversity in building design and architecture
 - Steel panels
 - Enhanced face materials
 - Modern style windows
 - More colors
 - Cornices

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
June 11, 2019**

B. Call to Order

Vice Chair Placko called the meeting to order at 6:18pm

C. Consider the Minutes from the May 14, 2019 meeting

On a motion by Boardmember Placko and seconded by Boardmember Knudsen, the Board unanimously approved the May 14, 2019 minutes.

Vote: 5-0 (Boardmember Banda, absent)

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Chair Posten-Thompson, Placko, Carter, Knudsen, Thomas

NAYS – None

D. Discuss and review the following Design Review cases for action at the May 14, 2019 Meeting:

NONE

E. Other Business:

New planning assistant Heather Omta was introduced to the Board.

F. Adjournment

Meeting was adjourned. 6:19p.m. Motion by Boardmember Carter, second by Vice Chair J. Seth Placko. Boardmember. Sean Banda left phone conference call at 5:52p.m.

The City of Mesa is committed to making its public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. For special accommodations, please contact the City Manager's Office at (480) 644-3333 or AzRelay 7-1-1 at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. **Si necesita asistencia o traducción en español, favor de llamar al menos 48 horas antes de la reunión al 480-644-2767.**